Appendix F: Municipal Buildings LOS Review
Memorandum

Date: May 7, 2008

To: Patricia Love, Assistant Director of Community Development

cc: Ron Loewen, Project Manager

From: Gil Cerise, Senior Planner

Subject: Administrative/Municipal Capital Facilities LOS Standards Research

Administrative/Municipal Capital Facilities LOS Standards

We have reviewed several City comprehensive plans in order to assess what standards they used for Administrative offices or municipal facilities. The following represents a summary of our findings by jurisdiction:

City of Tacoma

The City of Tacoma includes a table showing both concurrency-related capital facilities LOS, and non-concurrency capital facilities LOS. Among the non-concurrency LOS standards are:

- Municipal Buildings – City Government: 0.88 square feet per capita
- Municipal Buildings – Community and Human Services: As needed

Thurston County

Thurston County establishes a Level of Service Standard for an “All County Government” category in its CFP which is expressed in gross square feet per Full Time Equivalent (FTE). Thurston County’s All County Government standard for 2005-2010 is as follows:

- 219 gross square feet per FTE employee for new construction

City of Woodinville

Berk & Associates identified the City of Woodinville as having a LOS standard for administrative/general government facilities. The City of Woodinville Capital Facility Element includes the following standard for City Offices under the Municipal Buildings category:

- 1,150 square feet of public service and/or administrative office space per 1,000 population
May 7, 2008
Page 2

In City of Woodinville, water and sewer utilities, and fire services are provided off-site by non-city entities.

City of Kenmore

Berk & Associates also identified the City of Kenmore as having a LOS standard for administrative/general government facilities. The City of Kenmore includes two ratios in its discussion of Public Services provided by the City. Similar to Mukilteo, the City does not provide all local services to its citizens. Utilities and fire protection services are provided by other non-city entities, and police services are provided under contract with King County Sheriff's Office.

The two level of service ratios referenced in the Public Services element are:

- 0.63 square feet of General Government Services per capita

City of Covington

Berk & Associates provided the administrative/general government capital facilities ratio for City of Covington which is:

- 1,800 square feet of office space per 1,000 population

Kitsap County

Appendix A of the Kitsap County Capital Facilities Plan includes a LOS standard for each type of capital facility. The LOS standard for "Administration Buildings" category is:

- 1,097 square feet per 1,000 population

City of Issaquah

The City of Issaquah establishes a Level of Service standard for "Municipal Facilities (Administration Buildings and Maintenance Buildings) on a square footage per capita or user basis. Table CF-1B in the City’s Comprehensive Plan establishes the following LOS standards for this type of facility:

- Single Family: 9.92 square feet of municipal building per dwelling unit
- Multifamily: 5.36 square feet of municipal building per dwelling unit
- Non-residential: 0.00357 square feet of municipal building per Non-Residential square foot.

This formula is more complex than that used by other jurisdictions surveyed, and would require a break-down of the number of single-family. This category includes city hall and various
Outside of Washington State, City of Eugene, Oregon found an average government facility need of 236 square feet per employee in a survey of other government facilities. This compares to the City of Eugene’s standard arrived upon in its space planning study for 2030 government office needs of 240 square feet per employee, and the late 1980’s data contained in the MRSC Level of Service Standards: Measures for Maintaining the Quality of Community Life which range from 305 square feet/employee to 374 square feet/employee.

**Translation to City of Mukilteo Needs**

The City of Mukilteo has a need to house 29 staff positions within City Hall in 2008. In addition, future staffing needs in 2010 are projected at 44 staff positions housed in City Hall, and 46 staff positions housed in City Hall in 2025. The following table translates the City’s future staffing needs into an office space analysis for municipal/administrative government facilities based upon the variety of standards found in this updated memo.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Space Requirements for Budgeted Employees</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>46</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988 Building Owners and Managers survey contained in MRSC Level of Service Standards publication</td>
<td>305 – 374</td>
<td>8,845 – 10,846</td>
<td>13,420 – 16,456</td>
<td>14,030 – 17,204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Government Facility Need from City of Eugene, Oregon Space Needs Analysis</td>
<td>236</td>
<td>6,844</td>
<td>10,884</td>
<td>10,856</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Eugene, Oregon Standard Used for City Hall</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>6,960</td>
<td>10,560</td>
<td>11,040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thurston County</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>6,351</td>
<td>9,636</td>
<td>10,074</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bainbridge Island</td>
<td>365</td>
<td>10,585</td>
<td>16,060</td>
<td>16,790</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: [1] Some of the ratios listed here may not contain Council Chambers or meeting rooms.

Based upon the above analysis, the City of Mukilteo should have administrative or municipal office space of between 6,351 and 10,846 square feet in order to meet its existing city staff needs for a City Hall facility in 2008. In addition, the City should have between 10,074 and 17,204 square feet in order to accommodate the needs of its staff members out to 2025. Based upon anticipated staffing increases in over the next two years, the City should have this additional space available by 2010 in order to accommodate staff increases anticipated as a result of annexation. It should be noted that some of the ratios may exclude meeting facilities such as Council chamber in the ratio.
maintenance facilities.

City of Snoqualmie

Berk & Associates also noted that City of Snoqualmie expresses its general government/administrative function in terms of a ratio of FTE employees per 1,000 Population. The City does not express a square footage of office space per capita or per 1,000 Population as most the other jurisdictions surveyed. The City of Snoqualmie’s ratio is:

- 1.1 FTE employee per 1,000 Population

City of Renton

The City of Renton includes an “Economic Development/Administration” category in its CFP. However, there does not appear to be a LOS standard established for this category.

Other Cities

Staff reviewed the capital facility plans for the following jurisdictions, but was unable to find a specific level of service for administrative or city offices for them: Lynnwood, Mountlake Terrace, Edmonds, Everett, and Shoreline.

Application of Administrative/Municipal Capital Facilities Standards to Mukilteo

If the City of Mukilteo were to apply the various standards shown from national and other jurisdictions, then they would arrive at the following quantities of office space for administrative or municipal services.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>19,569</td>
<td>22,000</td>
<td>10,310</td>
<td>14,000</td>
<td>36,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tacoma</td>
<td>0.88 sf per capita</td>
<td>17,045 sf</td>
<td>19,360 sf</td>
<td>9,073 sf</td>
<td>12,320 sf</td>
<td>31,680 sf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Woodinville</td>
<td>1,150 sf per 1,000 population</td>
<td>22,274 sf</td>
<td>25,300 sf</td>
<td>11,856 sf</td>
<td>16,100 sf</td>
<td>41,400 sf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenmore</td>
<td>0.63 sf per capita</td>
<td>12,202 sf</td>
<td>13,860 sf</td>
<td>6,495 sf</td>
<td>8,820 sf</td>
<td>22,680 sf</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The standards used by City of Issaquah and Thurston County are more complex and would require estimates of employees under each scenario (for Thurston County) and a breakdown of housing types and commercial square footage under each scenario (for the Issaquah method).

**Conclusion**

It appears that the range of square footage necessary for combined projected City and MUGA population of 36,000 would be 22,680 square feet using Kenmore’s standard on the low end, and 64,800 square feet using Covington’s standard on the high end. It should be noted that City of Kenmore provides a larger amount of services via contract than other cities shown in this survey. Most cities surveyed appear to be within the range of 31,000 to 41,000 square feet for general or administrative government facilities.
Memorandum

Date: June 5, 2008

To: Patricia Love, Assistant Director of Community Development

cc: Ron Loewen, Project Manager

From: Gil Cerise, Senior Planner

Subject: Administrative/Municipal Capital Facilities LOS Standards Research

Administrative/Municipal Capital Facilities LOS Standards

Per city staff direction, we have prepared some additional research on administrative or municipal capital facility Level of Service (LOS) standards. Staff asked us to research:

- LOS standards expressed in amount of administrative/municipal space per employee of full-time equivalent (FTE);
- Review the LOS standards for a wider range of cities than identified in the May 7th memo; and
- Ensure that we provide qualifiers for the standards found and the cities being compared (i.e., no Council chambers included in the LOS standard, etc.)

The previous memorandum included a review of the following jurisdiction’s LOS standards for administrative/municipal facilities: Tacoma, Thurston County, Woodinville, Kenmore, Covington, Kitsap County, Issaquah, Snoqualmie, and Renton. Of these jurisdictions, only Thurston County has an LOS standard expressed in gross square feet per FTE employee. Thurston County’s LOS standard is 219 gross square feet per full time equivalent employee. Several jurisdictions were mentioned in the previous memo as not outlining specific LOS standards. In cases where these jurisdictions are repeated within this memo, we document in more detail what their plans do say about administrative/municipal capital facility standards.

Municipal Research Services Center (MRSC)

MRSC authored a publication on LOS standards entitled *Level of Service Standards: Measures for Maintaining the Quality of Community Life* in September 1994 (Report No. 31). This report reviews the impact of Growth Management Act (GMA) on capital facilities planning and discusses various techniques for assessing LOS standards for a variety of capital facilities. There is a brief section in this publication that is specific to administrative facilities.
June 5, 2008
Page 2

The Administrative Facilities section of this publication found that many city administration offices are crowded compared to their private sector counterparts. The Urban Land Institute 1988 data showed a nationwide average of 347 square feet per employee. A 1988 Building Owner and Managers survey on office space reported that employees in a production office enjoyed an average of 305 square feet while those in a headquarters office on average occupied 374 square feet. These averages include accessory space such as restrooms, hallways and conference rooms (MRSC 1994).

The MRSC publication also cites a mini-survey conducted by City of Bainbridge Island of comparable-sized cities in 1991 that found space per employee ratios ranged from 75 to 210 square feet per employee.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Bainbridge Island</th>
<th>Des Moines</th>
<th>Oak Harbor</th>
<th>Lacey</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1991 Space per Employee Ratio (square feet)</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>92 (185 after planned expansion)</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: MRSC, 1994

A committee conducting an analysis of Bainbridge Island’s administrative office concluded that the City should provide office space equaling:

- 365 square feet per employee and
- 1,149 square feet per 1,000 population should be provided.

These recommendations covered space for city hall, police and public works functions.

Since this survey was conducted in 1994, Bainbridge Island has constructed a new city hall facility. The new city hall is 24,107 square feet (compared to 6,600 square feet in 1991).

**Survey of Other Cities LOS Standards for Administrative/Municipal Facilities**

**City of Shoreline**

The City of Shoreline’s Capital Facilities Element identifies a quantitative LOS standard for the city-provided transportation, surface water, parks and recreation, and police facilities (Policy CF33). However, there are no quantitative LOS standards applied to administrative/municipal capital facilities. The supporting analysis appendix to the Capital Facilities element provides more detail on the LOS standards of the four city-provided facilities listed above, but no additional detail on the administrative or general municipal facilities. It should be noted that the City is embarking upon a project to build a new city hall. However, information provided on the project on the City’s website does not indicate the planned capacity of the new facility.

**City of Lynnwood**

The City of Lynnwood’s Capital Facility Element states that it bases its needs assessments for facilities on past planning efforts. Although quantitative measures are shown for transportation
facilities, there are no identified quantitative LOS standards for administrative or municipal facilities contained within the Lynnwood Comprehensive Plan. The City’s Capital Improvement Plan (CIP) includes a rating criteria of whether or not a project meets a specific LOS standard. However, the City’s current CIP (2008-2013) does not contain any projects that identify an LOS standard for administrative or municipal facilities such as a city hall.

City of Edmonds
The City of Edmonds maintains quantitative LOS standards for transportation, parks, and utilities. The City’s Capital Facility Element and CIP guidance for administrative facilities are general and qualitative rather than quantitative.

City of Sammamish
The City of Sammamish includes an LOS standard for its General Government Services category of 0.5 square foot per capita, or as otherwise determined through the City Civic Center/Park Study and Master Plan Process.

City of Mill Creek
The City of Mill Creek includes both LOS standards and LOS guidelines within its Capital Facilities Element. LOS standards are for those facilities with GMA-requirement that is subject to concurrency requirements, such as transportation facilities. LOS guidelines are not required by GMA and are not subject to concurrency requirements. The City places its city hall and other administrative facilities, such as its library in the LOS guideline category.

The Capital Facilities Element details the office space available for various city hall/administrative functions in the city hall and adjacent city government office buildings:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City Hall Building Function</th>
<th>Area (square feet)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Administration</td>
<td>3,473</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Works Shop/Maintenance</td>
<td>1,921</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police Department (Admin., Lockers, Storage)</td>
<td>4,149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Council Chambers/Conference Room</td>
<td>1,442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Room (Recreation Programming and Public Assembly)</td>
<td>1,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common Areas (Lunch Room, Lobby, Restrooms, Hallways)</td>
<td>3,007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Archive/Storage Space</td>
<td>754</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>15,846</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City Offices Annex Function</th>
<th>Area (square feet)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recreation and Community Programs</td>
<td>3,791</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leased</td>
<td>23,815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Common Areas (Hallway, Restrooms, Elevator, Storage/Mechanical)</td>
<td>4,236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>31,842</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: City of Mill Creek Comprehensive Plan

However, the LOS guideline shown is qualitative rather than quantitative. The LOS guideline states:

Adequate facilities should be available for City personnel to perform their various service functions to the satisfaction of the community. This would include administration, community development, public works, finance, police, and recreation program and meeting facilities. Space for storage and maintenance of City equipment is also necessary.

The City makes the following finding within the Capital Facilities Element based upon this LOS guideline: At this time, City personnel are performing their service functions at maximum capacity; however there is little additional capacity to accommodate additional services or personnel.

**City of Mountlake Terrace**

The City has plans to replace its current civic center facility that includes both city hall and a fire station. However, the City does not provide an explicit quantitative LOS standard for general government or administrative government facilities. The City's Capital Facilities Element and CIP include discussion about the age of the existing facility and how it has outlived its lifecycle.

**City of Everett**

The City of Everett distinguishes between facilities that are required to meet concurrency, such
as transportation, and those that are not, such as general government facilities. Those that are not required by the GMA to meet concurrency are assessed for individual needs in the City’s capital plans and budgeting documents.

City Capital Facilities Element Policy 6.1.3 states that:

“Policy 6.1.3 Concurrency shall be required of those facilities that are mandated by the GMA for funding purposes (transportation, water and sewer). A six-year capital-funding plan shall be developed to cover other city facilities that are not subject to GMA concurrency requirements. The City will work with the purveyors of other services to assure the provision of facilities and services in an appropriate and timely manner.

(a) Adequate transportation, water and sewer facilities are considered necessary to all development by the State of Washington; therefore these facilities must be concurrent with development.

(b) The ability to provide adequate police, fire and emergency medical services, parks library services and City administration facilities is necessary for orderly development to occur. Facilities in this category are subject to local adequacy standards. The City shall have capital budgets that provide funding for these services...”

The Capital Facilities Element outlines inventory, future locations, and funding sources for “City Buildings and Other Related Facilities” category. Under forecast for future needs, there is a blank, although the text states that plans for new construction and expansion have been outlined. Existing facilities in this category are facilities used by City Administration, the Fire and Police Departments, the Library, the Animal Shelter, and the City Senior Center.

A review of the City’s Capital Improvement Program did not find a specified LOS standard for city general government/administrative facilities.

City of Marysville
The City of Marysville also has a category for “City Facilities” separate from transportation and parks facilities. The City’s Capital Facilities Element states that the City’s capital facilities must be “adequate” per GMA, and that some facilities, such as transportation are required to meet concurrency per the GMA. The City’s Capital Facilities Element further identifies LOS standards as:

Levels-of-service are quantifiable measures of capacity, such as acres of parkland per capita, vehicle capacity of a roadway, or gallons per customer per day utilizing the city’s water system.

Minimum standards are established at the local level. Factors that influence local standards are citizen, city council and planning commission recommendations,
national standards, federal and state mandates, and the standards of neighboring jurisdictions.

The City does have two “City Facilities” projects in its Capital Facilities Element: 1) City Hall Civic Center, and 2) Public Works Campus. However, these do not show meeting LOS as a prioritization category. The prioritization for both facilities is “public benefit of service improvement.” The justification listed for both facilities is “capacity and facility upgrade.” There are no quantitative LOS standards shown for either facility.

City of Bothell
Bothell has an established LOS standard of 1,280 square feet of office space per 1,000 population for city offices. However Capital Facilities Element CF-P1 states that before a new city office facility is constructed, this LOS standard should be re-evaluated.

Snohomish County
A review of the Snohomish County Capital Facilities Element showed that there was no quantitative LOS standard for general government offices. At the time that the Capital Facilities Element was written, several general government offices were being consolidated in a downtown location from various leased locations. The narrative did not discuss and LOS standards used in determining the office space needs for this general government facility.

Comparative Standards from Outside Washington State
During research administrative/municipal government facility LOS standards, staff found a city hall space needs report for the City of Eugene, Oregon that concluded that the City needs a city office facility that allows for approximately 240 square feet per employee in 2030 when planning to consolidate existing city offices in a single location. As part of this space planning study, the City of Eugene looked at other government agencies space needs which are summarized in the table below.
Conclusion

In our survey of Washington State jurisdictions that establish LOS standards for administrative/municipal government functions, only two jurisdictions explicitly state their administrative/municipal LOS standards in square feet per employee:

- Thurston County: 219 gross square feet per FTE employee for new construction
- Bainbridge Island included an LOS standard of 365 square feet per employee at the time that it developed its space plans for its new city hall in the mid-1990’s.

Most Washington State jurisdictions appear to have qualitative standards for capital facilities that are not required to meet concurrency by the GMA, such as city hall facilities. These qualitative standards are outlined in goals and policies contained within the Capital Facility Element and as justification within the Cities’ CIP. Those that do include a quantitative LOS standard do not provide enough detail to distinguish whether or not council chambers or other meeting facilities are included within the LOS standard.
Appendix G: Outside Agencies
Map 8. Water & Wastewater Districts
Map 9. Port of Everett